

Anomalous Hall effect for the phonon heat conductivity in a paramagnetic dielectric

Y. Kagan* and L. A. Maksimov
Kurchatov Institute, Moscow 123182, Russia
(Dated: October 27, 2018)

The theory of anomalous Hall effect for the heat transfer in a paramagnetic dielectric, discovered experimentally in [1], is developed. The appearance of the phonon heat flux normal to both the temperature gradient and the magnetic field is connected with the interaction of magnetic ions with the crystal field oscillations. In crystals with an arbitrary phonon spectrum this interaction creates the elliptical polarization of phonons. The kinetics related to phonon scattering induced by the spin-phonon interaction determines an origin of the off-diagonal phonon density matrix. The combination of the both factors is decisive for the phenomenon under consideration.

PACS numbers: 66.70.+f, 72.15.Gd, 72.20.Pa

A novel interesting phenomenon is found experimentally in recent paper [1]. The matter concerns an analog of the anomalous Hall effect (AHE) for the heat conductivity of an ionic paramagnetic dielectric. In fact, applying magnetic field \vec{B} in the direction normal to heat flow \vec{j} , the authors have discovered an appearance of the heat transfer in the direction normal to \vec{B} and \vec{j} . For the complete lack of free charged carriers and negligible role of the spin-spin coupling at the parameters concerned, the transverse flow is naturally associated with the evolution of the phonon system. However, the magnetic field does not directly act on phonons and only polarizes paramagnetic ions. It is the coupling between phonons and subsystem of isolated ions carrying magnetic moment \vec{M} that determines the formation of the picture observed. Note in this aspect that the phenomenon concerned is an analog of the AHE in the paramagnetic phase of a ferromagnetic above the Curie point, discovered a long time ago [2]. An existence of the effect found in [1] has been confirmed in work [3]. In both [1] and [3] the choice of terbium gallium garnet (TbGG) was not accidental. In this compound for $T < 10K$ the heat conductivity due to spin-phonon coupling (SPC) proves to be about two orders of the magnitude smaller as compared with gadolinium garnet [4] of the identical structure.

As it is known, in most of ion dielectrics the spin-phonon relaxation is determined by the two-phonon processes, see, e.g., [5] and [6]. Usually this supposes the presence of the Kramers doublet in the ground state and the transitions via virtual excitation of higher Kramers doublets. Trivalent ion Tb^{3+} has the even number of f-electrons and the Kramers degeneration is absent. However, for rare earth ions with the even number of f-electrons, an appearance of the quasi-doublet structure is typical for splitting the multiplet in the crystalline field with the level spacing ε_{12} of about several Kelvins in the ground state. TbGG is a striking example of the similar compound, see, e.g., [7]. From the general symmetry reasons and the direct analysis [8, 9, 10] one can conclude that the SPC under conditions concerned reduces to a scalar production of magnetic moment \vec{M} and

the orbital moment related to the motion of surrounding ions. At low temperatures when the long wave acoustic branches alone are excited, the displacement of all atoms in the elementary cell for each mode is the same. One can show in this case that the total orbital moment of atoms in the elementary cell reduces to the angular moment of the cell center of gravity. We will assume that the magnetic ordering temperature $T_c \ll T$ and the magnitude of magnetic field allows us to neglect the dipole-dipole interaction between ions. This gives a possibility to analyze the phenomenon adequately, considering a simple model system with one magnetic atom in the elementary cell and assuming high symmetry of SPC. Thus, the Hamiltonian of SPC can be represented as the spin-orbit interaction (see, e.g., [8])

$$H_1 = g \sum_n \vec{s}_n (\vec{U}_n \times \vec{P}_n), \quad (1)$$

where \vec{U}_n and \vec{P}_n are the vectors of displacement and momentum of the center of gravity in n -th elementary cell and \vec{s}_n is the isospin typical for the quasi-doublet. For the isotropic SPC, one has $\vec{s}_n \parallel \vec{M}_n$. Assuming that the spacing from the ground quasi-doublet to higher levels is $\Delta\varepsilon \gg T$, magnetic moment \vec{M}_n is determined by the parameters of the quasi-doublet components with the regard of their occupation. In the approximation linear in H_1 we can replace \vec{M}_n and, correspondingly \vec{s}_n , with the quantities \vec{M} and \vec{s} averaged over the crystal.

The present paper is devoted to determining the heat conduction tensor $\kappa_{odd}^{ab}(\vec{B})$ antisymmetric and odd in magnetic field \vec{B} [11]. The heat conduction problem is solved at low temperatures when the heat is carried with long wave acoustic phonons. A fraction of heat flow directed along $[\vec{M} \times \nabla T]$ arises from the elliptic renormalization of the polarization vectors of acoustic phonons with involving (1). The renormalization of the sound velocity does not take place. The effect occurs at an arbitrary character of the phonon dispersion spectrum and, in fact, at an arbitrary mechanism of phonon scattering and phonon-phonon coupling. In this communication we

restrict ourselves with considering phonon scattering at magnetic ions with the involvement of the level system which appears in the crystal field. The elements of density matrix $\rho_{ss'}(\vec{k}) = \langle a_{ks}^+ a_{ks'} \rangle$ off-diagonal in branches and found from the generalized Boltzmann kinetic equation play a key role in the formation of χ_{odd}^{ab} .

In recent paper [12] there has been attempted to explain theoretically the phenomenon observed in [1]. Taking SPC in the form analogous to (1), the authors have chosen a simplified model for the phonon spectrum in which two coincident transverse modes always exist for an arbitrary wave vector. Such degeneration is decisive for the consideration on the whole. In fact, in the general case the acoustic branches are not degenerated in most part of phase volume. The regions in which one can meet degeneration occupy, as a rule, relatively small fraction of the phase volume. This means a necessity of the kinetic consideration with involving the phonon scattering mechanisms.

2. Treating the phonon system in the harmonic approximation, we write the general Hamiltonian of the system with (1) as

$$H = H_0 + H_1, \quad H_0 = \sum_n \frac{1}{2m_0} \vec{P}_n^2 - \frac{m_0}{2} \sum_{nn'} D_{nn'}^{ab} U_n^a U_{n'}^b. \quad (2)$$

Here m_0 is the total mass of the elementary cell. Let us determine the Hamilton's equations from (2). For velocity V_n^a , one has straightforwardly

$$V_n^a = \dot{U}_n^a = P_n^a/m_0 + g e_{abc} b U_n^c, \quad (3)$$

where e_{abc} is the antisymmetric third-rank unit tensor. Using explicit expression (3), the equation of motion can be transformed to the form

$$-\ddot{U}_n^a = \sum_{n'} D_{nn'}^{ab} (U_n^b - U_{n'}^b) + 2g e_{abc} \dot{U}_n^b s^c. \quad (4)$$

Assuming further the consideration in the linear approximation for the spin-orbit interaction (SOI), we replaced P_n^b with $m_0 \dot{U}_n^b$ in the last term. A usual Fourier-transformation of linear equation (4) results in the dispersion equation

$$\omega^2 U_{\vec{k}}^a = D_{\vec{k}}^{ab} U_{\vec{k}}^b - 2ig\omega e_{abc} U_{\vec{k}}^b s^c, \quad (5)$$

where

$$D_{\vec{k}}^{ab} = \sum_{\vec{R}} D_{\vec{R}}^{ab} (1 - e^{i\vec{k}\vec{R}}), \quad \sum_{\vec{R}} D_{\vec{R}}^{ab} = 0. \quad (6)$$

Here $\vec{R} = \vec{r}_n - \vec{r}_{n'}$, \vec{r}_n is a position of the center of gravity in n -th cell. In zeroth order in SOI the solution of a set of equations (5) determines the dispersion law $\omega_s(\vec{k})$ for three acoustic branches and, correspondingly, three orthonormal polarization vectors $e_s^{(0)a}(\vec{k})$ in the long wave

limit. The latter ones can be chosen as real. In the approximation linear in the SOI one can conclude from (5) that the phonon spectrum remains unchanged and the polarization vectors alone renormalize. Let us introduce notation

$$U_s^a(\vec{k}) = e_s^{(0)a}(\vec{k}) + \delta e_s^a(\vec{k}). \quad (7)$$

Then from equation (5) one finds the small rotation of the polarization vector for s -th branch

$$\delta \vec{e}_1 = -2ig\omega_1 \left[\frac{((\vec{e}_2 \times \vec{e}_1) \vec{s})}{(\omega_1^2 - \omega_2^2)} \vec{e}_2 + \frac{((\vec{e}_3 \times \vec{e}_1) \vec{s})}{(\omega_1^2 - \omega_3^2)} \vec{e}_3 \right]. \quad (8)$$

Accordingly, for $s = 2$ and 3 . In the linear approximation in SOI the condition of orthonormality holds for as $e_s^{a*} e_{s'}^a = \delta_{ss'}$.

To find the phonon energy flow j^c with the presence of SOI, one can employ the general results obtained in [13]. The successive use of the continuity equation, reflecting the local law of energy conservation for the slow spatial temperature variation, results in the expression

$$j^c = \frac{1}{2V} m_0 \sum_{nn'} R_{nn'}^c D_{nn'}^{ab} U_n^a V_{n'}^b. \quad (9)$$

Hereafter the volume is $V=1$. In this expression the velocity $V_{n'}^b$ is determined by relation (3). Let us expand vectors U_n^a (and $V_n^a = \dot{U}_n^a$) into the normal modes in the representation of secondary quantization ($\hbar = 1$)

$$U_n^a = \sum_{ks} \sqrt{\frac{1}{2m_0 N \omega_{ks}}} \exp(i\vec{k}\vec{r}_n) [e_s^a(\vec{k}) a_{ks} + e_s^{a*}(-\vec{k}) a_{-\vec{k}s}^+]. \quad (10)$$

Substituting these expressions into (9) and employing relation (6), we find for the averaged operator of the energy flow

$$\langle j^c \rangle = \frac{1}{4} \sum_{kss'} \left\{ \left(\sqrt{\frac{\omega_{ks}}{\omega_{ks'}}} + \sqrt{\frac{\omega_{ks'}}{\omega_{ks}}} \right) (\nabla_k^c D_k^{ab}) e_{ks}^{a*} e_{ks'}^b \right\} \rho_{ss'}(\vec{k}), \quad (11)$$

where $\rho_{ss'}(\vec{k}) = \langle a_{ks}^+ a_{ks'} \rangle$. Keeping the approximation linear in SOI, we neglect anomalous averages $\langle a_{-ks} a_{ks'} \rangle$ and $\langle a_{ks}^+ a_{-ks'}^+ \rangle$ in (11). For zero order approximation in SOI the polarization vectors in (11) are real and the expression in the figure brackets is symmetric over indices s, s' . Thus only the symmetric and real component of density matrix gives nonzero contribution to ((11)). Assuming $\rho_{ss'}(\vec{k}) = n_s(\vec{k}) \delta_{ss'}$ and the relation

$$(\nabla_k^c D_k^{ab}) e_{ks}^a e_{ks}^b = \partial \omega_{ks}^2 / \partial k^c = 2\omega_{ks} C_{ks}^c, \quad (12)$$

where $\vec{C}_s = \partial \omega_s / \partial \vec{k}$ is the sound velocity, from (11) we find an ordinary expression for the heat flow

$$\langle j_0^c \rangle = \sum_{ks} \omega_{ks} C_{ks}^c n_s(\vec{k}) \quad (13)$$

The contribution linear in SOI appears in (11) with involving the renormalization of the polarization vectors (7)

$$e_{ks}^{a*} e_{ks'}^b \rightarrow -(\delta e_{ks}^a) e_{ks'}^{(0)b} + e_{ks}^{(0)a} (\delta e_{ks'}^b) \quad (14)$$

Substituting relations (8) into this expression, we find that the contribution diagonal in modes vanishes. The off-diagonal term with $ks = 1$ and $ks' = 2$ equals

$$2ig \frac{(\vec{e}_2 \times \vec{e}_1) \vec{s}}{(\omega_1^2 - \omega_2^2)} (\omega_1 e_2^a e_2^b - \omega_2 e_1^a e_1^b) - 2ig \frac{(\vec{e}_3 \times \vec{e}_2) \vec{s}}{(\omega_2^2 - \omega_3^2)} \omega_2 e_1^a e_3^b + 2ig \frac{(\vec{e}_3 \times \vec{e}_1) \vec{s}}{(\omega_1^2 - \omega_3^2)} \omega_1 e_3^a e_2^b \quad (15)$$

With substitution (14),(15) into (11) the expression in the figure brackets, proves to be antisymmetric over indices 1 and 2. The contribution linear in SOI in (11) does not vanish if the off-diagonal terms of density matrix are nonzero. In the expression (15) the first term plays a key role. To avoid the cumbersome expressions, we will find the approximate value for the flow (11), keeping the first term alone $\langle j_{SO}^a \rangle = \langle j_{12}^a \rangle + \langle j_{23}^a \rangle + \langle j_{31}^a \rangle$, where

$$\langle j_{12}^a \rangle = ig \sum_k \left(\sqrt{\frac{\omega_1}{\omega_2}} + \sqrt{\frac{\omega_2}{\omega_1}} \right) \frac{2\omega_1 \omega_2 (\vec{e}_2 \times \vec{e}_1) \vec{s}}{(\omega_1^2 - \omega_2^2)} (C_2^a - C_1^a) \rho_{12}. \quad (16)$$

To find the flow finally, it is necessary to determine the imaginary part of nonequilibrium off-diagonal density matrix ρ_{12} . We employ a conventional procedure to derive the kinetic equation, see, e.g., [14]. The general equation of evolution reads

$$-i\partial_t \rho_{kk'} = \langle [a_k^+ a_{k'}, H_0 + H'] \rangle \quad (17)$$

Here H' is the Hamiltonian for the phonon scattering and H_0 is the starting Hamiltonian of noninteracting phonons (2). To simplify notations, we introduce a generalized index for the mode $k \equiv \vec{k}, s$. In the frequency representation

$$(\omega + \omega_k - \omega_{k'}) \rho_{kk'} = I_{kk'}, \quad I_{kk'} = \langle [a_k^+ a_{k'}, H'] \rangle \quad (18)$$

The formal stationary solution ($\omega_k \neq \omega_{k'}$) reads

$$\rho_{kk'} |_{\omega \rightarrow 0} = \frac{I_{kk'}}{\omega_k - \omega_{k'}}. \quad (19)$$

At low temperatures, as we have already mentioned, the main mechanism of scattering is connected with the coupling between phonons and magnetic ions. The splitting of rare-earth ion multiplet with the crystalline field V_{cr} and the reduction of the symmetry for oscillating part V_{cr} make decisive the Raman two-phonon scattering via virtual excitation of the other multiplet levels [5, 6]. For garnets like Tb^{3+} , the ground state is a quasi-doublet with the small spacing of about several Kelvins between the doublet components.

Considering the region of low temperatures $T \leq 6K$, we assume that the kinetics is determined by the scattering of phonons at this quasi-doublet. The higher levels lie at $\varepsilon_i \geq 50K$ and we neglect rescattering through them. In this case Hamiltonian H' can be represented in the general form

$$H' = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{\vec{r}_n} \sum_{fg\alpha} e^{i(\vec{g}-\vec{f})\vec{r}_n} A_{fg\alpha}^{\alpha\alpha} \xi_n^\alpha a_f^\dagger a_g. \quad (20)$$

Here $\alpha = 1, 2$ numerates the doublet levels and $\xi_n^\alpha = 1, 0$. The commutator in (18) equals

$$\langle [a_k^+ a_{k'}, \xi_n^\alpha a_f^\dagger a_g] \rangle = \langle a_k^+ \xi_n^\alpha a_g \rangle \delta_{k'f} - \langle a_f^\dagger \xi_n^\alpha a_{k'} \rangle \delta_{kg}$$

Using equations (18) for these correlators, we obtain some quadruple operator correlators.

Restricting with the Born approximation, we decouple these correlators in the mean-field approximation. As a result, we have at $\omega \rightarrow 0$

$$I_{kk'} = -i\pi \frac{1}{N} \sum_{g\alpha} P_\alpha (1 - P_\alpha) A_{k'g\alpha}^{\alpha\alpha} A_{gk}^{\alpha\alpha} \{ \delta(\omega_k - \omega_g) (n_k - n_g) + \delta(\omega_{k'} - \omega_g) (n_{k'} - n_g) \}, \quad (21)$$

where $P_\alpha = \langle \xi_n^\alpha \rangle$ is the occupation value of level α . From (21) we can conclude that $I_{kk'} = I_{k'k}$. As a result, we see that off-diagonal matrix $\rho_{kk'}$ (19) is antisymmetric. For the equilibrium distribution, $I_{kk'} = 0$. Nonzero result appears only for nonequilibrium distribution $f_k = n_k - N_k^{(0)}$ due to temperature gradient. In the τ -approximation the expression (21) can be represented as

$$I_{kk'} = -i\frac{1}{2} (\Omega_{kk'} f_k + \Omega_{k'k} f_{k'}), \quad (22)$$

$$\Omega_{kk'} = 2\pi \frac{1}{N} \sum_{g\alpha} P_\alpha (1 - P_\alpha) (A_{k'g\alpha}^{\alpha\alpha} A_{gk}^{\alpha\alpha}) \delta(\omega_k - \omega_g). \quad (23)$$

The usual solution of the problem for the longitudinal heat conduction yields

$$f_k = -(\omega_k / \Omega_{kk} T^2) N_k^{(0)} \left(1 + N_k^{(0)} \right) \vec{C}_k \nabla T \quad (24)$$

The substitution of the off-diagonal density matrix (19) into (16) with involving (22)-(24) solves the problem for the heat transfer due to SOI. The relaxation frequencies (23) depend on a product of the transition amplitudes with $k \neq k'$ instead of a usual square of the modulus of the transition amplitude when everything is determined by the diagonal density matrix. This typical feature is inherent in any scattering mechanism, in particular, due to phonon anharmonicity.

Let us return to the notations adopted in (16) and make a significant remark about the symmetry for a product of polarization vectors with the same wave vector \vec{k} entering this expression. In the long wave approximation for the crystals of the sufficiently high symmetry the off-diagonal elements of the dynamical matrix

read $D_k^{ab} \sim k^a k^b$, e.g., [15]. Rewrite the dispersion equation (5) for zero order approximation in SOI in the form $(\omega_{ks}^2 - D_k^{aa}) e_{ks}^a = \sum_{b \neq a} D_k^{ab} e_{ks}^b$. One can show that, with varying the sign of the separate projection of wave vector, D_k^{aa} and ω_{ks}^2 remain unchanged. Then from the given equation it follows that the projection of polarization vector e_{ks}^a changes its sign for the substitution k^a with $(-k^a)$ conserving the sign of the other projections. This property can be expressed in terms

$$e_{ks}^a = \tilde{e}_s^a(\vec{k}) \text{sign} k^a. \quad (25)$$

Here $\tilde{e}_s^a(\vec{k})$ is a unit vector remaining unchanged with varying the sign of an arbitrary projection of wave vector \vec{k} .

Let magnetic field and magnetic moment \vec{M} be in the direction of the z -axis, while the longitudinal ∇T be in the direction of the x -axis. Then, substituting (19) and (22)-(25) into (16), we find, restoring \hbar , k_B and volume V , for the transverse component of the heat conduction tensor $\chi^{yx} = \chi_{12}^{yx} + \chi_{23}^{yx} + \chi_{31}^{yx}$,

$$\begin{aligned} \chi_{12}^{yx} &\simeq k_B \frac{g \hbar^2}{V} \sum_k s^z (\tilde{e}_1 \times \tilde{e}_2)^z \left(\sqrt{\frac{\omega_1}{\omega_2}} + \sqrt{\frac{\omega_2}{\omega_1}} \right) \\ &\times \frac{2\omega_1 \omega_2 \text{sign} k^x \text{sign} k^y}{(\omega_1^2 - \omega_2^2)(\omega_1 - \omega_2)} (c_1^y - c_2^y) (F_{12} c_1^x + F_{21} c_2^x), \quad (26) \\ F_{12} &= -\frac{1}{2} \omega_1 \frac{\Omega_{12}}{\Omega_{11}} \frac{1}{(k_B T)^2} N_1^{(0)} \left(1 + N_1^{(0)} \right) \end{aligned}$$

Recall that $s^z \equiv \langle s^z \rangle$. The expression obtained demonstrates an existence of the anomalous phonon Hall effect under comparatively general conditions conserving the intrinsic symmetry. It is interesting that the kinetics, reflecting phonon scattering character, enters (26) only as a ratio like Ω_{12}/Ω_{11} . This holds for any dominant mechanism of scattering. Under these conditions the transverse heat transfer is determined mainly by the spectral properties of the phonon system. Note, as it follows from (26), that a quantitative enhancement of the effect takes place if the region in which branches ω_{ks} come close is noticeable. We will give a quantitative estimate of the effect, assuming that the role of these regions in the integral determining (26) is limited in the general case.

For the estimate, one should determine the magnitude of parameter g introduced formally. The SOI (1) due to two-phonon processes accompanying vibrations of the crystalline field has the same origin as Hamiltonian H' (20). The Hamiltonian of single-phonon interaction is written usually for a mode $(\vec{k}s)$ in the simplified form $V'(U_{ks}/a)(ka)$, where V' is close to the magnitude of the static crystalline field (see, e.g., [6]). Factor (ka) appears with regard to the relative motion of magnetic ion and surrounding atoms. In second order in this interaction, the standard unitary transformation results in the spin-orbit interaction as (see [8])

$$\langle s^z \rangle V'^2 U_{ks} V_{ks'} \frac{\hbar}{C^2} \frac{\omega_{ks}^2}{\varepsilon_{12}^2 - \hbar^2 \omega_{ks}^2}$$

To simplify, we introduce here an averaged value for sound velocity \bar{C} and take $\omega_{ks} \simeq \omega_{ks'}$. Choosing two-mode contribution to SOI, written in the form (1), we have $\langle s^z \rangle g m_0 U_{ks} V_{ks'}$. In fact, we should mean the displacement in H_1 as a relative displacement of ions. Thus in this expression, as well as in the final one (26), $\tilde{g} = g(ka)^2$ should be implied instead of g . Comparing the expressions presented and assuming the temperature $T > \varepsilon_{12}$, we find $\tilde{g} \simeq V'^2 / (\hbar m_0 \bar{C}^2)$.

Returning to (26), let us make an integral dimensionless. Dividing sound velocity by \bar{C} , we obtain $\chi_{12}^{yx} \sim 3\pi^{-2} (\hbar \bar{C}/T)^2 \int dk k^2 \dots$. The remaining part of the integrand is dimensionless. Putting that $\mu_{eff} B < k_B T$, we find within the accuracy of a numerical factor

$$\chi^{yx} \simeq k_B \tilde{g} (k_B \Theta_D / \hbar \bar{C}) (T / \Theta_D) (\mu_{eff} B / k_B T). \quad (27)$$

Taking $V' \simeq 50K$, $\bar{C} \simeq 4 * 10^5 \text{ cm/s}$, $\Theta_D \simeq 400K$, we arrive at $\chi^{yx} \sim 10^{-7} (\mu_{eff} B / k_B T) (W/cmK)$. Using the experimental value for χ^{yx} [1,4] at $\mu_{eff} B / k_B T \sim 1$, we find for the Hall angle

$$\eta = \chi^{yx} / \chi^{xx} \sim 2 * 10^{-5}. \quad (28)$$

In reality, this ratio may be larger since the numerical coefficient omitted in (28) can take the value significantly larger than unity due to the character in the behavior of integrand (26).

So, in the general case the anomalous phonon Hall effect originates from a combination of two important factors. The first of them is associated with an appearance of elliptic renormalization for phonon modes as a result of the spin-orbit interaction between phonons and paramagnetic ions. The second factor is connected with the proof that the off-diagonal density matrix of phonons does not vanish at the kinetics of the longitudinal heat transfer with the presence of temperature gradient ∇T . The latter predetermines a necessity to solve nonconventional kinetic equation in the problem of phonon heat transfer. The model of a crystal and interaction used in the paper is undoubtedly simplified. That is why, the fact that the estimate obtained for the Hall angle (28) with using the real parameters proves to be comparable with the experimental magnitudes [1, 3] lying within interval $10^{-4} \div 10^{-5}$ seems very encouraging.

* Electronic address: kagan@kiae.ru

- [1] C. Strohm, G.L.J.A. Rikken, and P. Wyder, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 155901 (2005).
- [2] I. K. Kikoin, Sov. Phys., 9,1,1936; JETP, 10, 1242 (1940).
- [3] A. V. Inyushkin, A. N. Taldenkov, JETP Lett., (in press).
- [4] G.A. Slack, D. W. Oliver, Phys. Rev. B4(2), 592, (1971).
- [5] Spin-Lattice Relaxation in Ionic Solids, edited by A.A. Manenkov and R. Orbach, Harper & Row, New York, 1966.

- [6] A. A. Abragam, B. Bleaney, *Electron Paramagnetic Resonance of Transition Ions*. Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1970.
- [7] J. A. Koningstein, C. J. Kane-Maguire, *Can. J. Chem.*, 52(20), 3445 (1974).
- [8] H. Capellmann, S. Lipinski, *Z. Phys. B – Cond. Mat.*, 83, 199, (1991).
- [9] A. S. Ioselevich, H. Capellmann, *Phys. Rev.*, B51, 11446(1995)
- [10] H. Capellmann and K.U. Neumann, *Z. Phys. B – Cond. Mat.*, 67, 53, (1987).
- [11] L. D. Landau, E. M. Lifshits, *The Physical Kinetics*, Pergamon Press, 1988.
- [12] L. Sheng et al., *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 96, 155901 (2006).
- [13] R.J. Hardy, *Phys. Rev.* 132, 168 (1963).
- [14] D. Zubarev et al, *Statistical Mechanics of Nonequilibrium Processes*. Academie Verlag, 2002.
- [15] L. D. Landau, E. M. Lifshits, *The theory of elasticity*, Pergamon Press, 1988.